

FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND LEGAL CONSEQUENCES OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION

The legal position of convicted offenders is complex, as are the social consequences that can result from a criminal conviction. After they have served their sentences, custodial or not, convicted offenders often continue to be subject to numerous restrictions, in many cases indefinitely. In short, criminal convictions can have adverse legal consequences that may affect convicted offenders in several aspects of their lives. In turn, these legal consequences can have broader social consequences. Legal consequences are often not formally part of the criminal law, but are regulated by different areas of law, such as administrative law, constitutional law, labour law, civil law and immigration law. For this reason, they are often obscured from judges as well as from defendants and their legal representatives in the courtroom. The breadth, severity, longevity and often hidden nature of these restrictions raises the question of whether offenders' fundamental rights are sufficiently protected. This book explores the nature and extent of the legal consequences of criminal convictions in Europe, Australia and the USA. It addresses the following questions: What legal consequences can a criminal conviction have? How do these consequences affect convicted offenders? And how can and should these consequences be limited by law?

Oñati International Series in Law and Society
A SERIES PUBLISHED FOR THE OÑATI INSTITUTE
FOR THE SOCIOLOGY OF LAW

General Editors

Rosemary Hunter David Nelken

Founding Editors

William L F Felstiner Eve Darian-Smith

Board of General Editors

Carlos Lugo, Hostos Law School, Puerto Rico
Jacek Kurczewski, Warsaw University, Poland
Marie-Claire Foblets, Leuven University, Belgium
Ulrike Schultz, Fern Universität, Germany

Recent titles in this series

Life Imprisonment and Human Rights

Edited by Dirk van Zyl Smit and Catherine Appleton

Trust in International Police and Justice Cooperation

Edited by Saskia Hufnagel and Carole McCartney

Human Rights Encounter Legal Pluralism

Edited by Eva Brems, Giselle Corradi and Mark Goodale

Transitional Justice and the Public Sphere: Engagement,
Legitimacy and Contestation

Edited by Chrisje Brants and Susanne Karstedt

Law and the Precarious Home: Socio Legal Perspectives
on the Home in Insecure Times

Edited by Helen Carr, Brendan Edgeworth and Caroline Hunter

Criminologies of the Military: Militarism, National Security and Justice

Edited by Andrew Goldsmith and Ben Wadham

Law and the Precarious Home: Socio Legal Perspectives
on the Home in Insecure Times

Edited by Helen Carr, Brendan Edgeworth and Caroline Hunter

Collective Bargaining and Collective Action: Labour Agency
and Governance in the 21st Century?

Edited by Julia López López

**For the complete list of titles in this series, see
'Oñati International Series in Law and Society' link at
[www.bloomsburyprofessional.com/uk/series/
onati-international-series-in-law-and-society](http://www.bloomsburyprofessional.com/uk/series/onati-international-series-in-law-and-society)**

Fundamental Rights and Legal Consequences of Criminal Conviction

Edited by
Sonja Meijer
Harry Annison
and
Ailbhe O'Loughlin

Oñati International Series in Law and Society
A SERIES PUBLISHED FOR THE OÑATI INSTITUTE
FOR THE SOCIOLOGY OF LAW

• H A R T •

OXFORD • LONDON • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

HART PUBLISHING

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Kemp House, Chawley Park, Cumnor Hill, Oxford, OX2 9PH, UK

HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

First published in Great Britain 2019

Copyright © The editors and contributors severally 2019

The editors and contributors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 to be identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 (<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>) except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union, <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2019.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Meijer, Sonja, 1980- editor. | Annison, Harry Michael John, 1985- editor. | O'Loughlin, Ailbhe, editor. | Oñati International Institute for the Sociology of Law, sponsoring body.

Title: Fundamental rights and legal consequences of criminal conviction / edited by Sonja Meijer, Harry Annison and Ailbhe O'Loughlin.

Description: Oxford, UK ; Chicago, Illinois : Hart Publishing, 2019. | Series: Oñati international series in law and society | Includes papers presented at a workshop sponsored by the Oñati International Institute for the Sociology of Law (IISL).—ECIP acknowledgments. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019004741 (print) | LCCN 2019006639 (ebook) | ISBN 9781509920983 (EPub) | ISBN 9781509920976 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Ex-convicts—Legal status, laws, etc.—Congresses. | Judgments, Criminal—Social aspects—Congresses.

Classification: LCC K638.5 A6 (ebook) | LCC K638.5 A6 F86 2019 (print) | DDC 345/.056—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019004741>

ISBN: HB: 978-1-50992-097-6
ePDF: 978-1-50992-099-0
ePub: 978-1-50992-098-3

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon

Printed and bound in Great Britain by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY



To find out more about our authors and books visit www.hartpublishing.co.uk. Here you will find extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

Acknowledgements

WE ARE GRATEFUL to the Oñati International Institute for the Sociology of Law (IISL) for accommodating a two-day workshop that enabled us to bring together a team of leading legal, socio-legal and criminological scholars from different parts of the world. At this workshop, first versions of the chapters that make up the bulk of this book were presented and discussed extensively. In Oñati, the IISL provided us with logistical and administrative support, which made our stay very pleasant. Our special thanks go to Malen Gordo Mendizabal for making the arrangements on behalf of the IISL.

Furthermore, we would like to thank the Kooijmans Institute of the VU University Amsterdam, which allocated a fellowship to Ailbhe O'Loughlin, allowing us to work closely together on the book for two weeks at the Law Faculty.

We are grateful to Professor Dirk Van Zyl Smit, who inspired us to undertake this project. We are also thankful to Dirk Van Zyl Smit, Shadd Maruna, Fergus McNeill, Nicola Padfield and Claire Lougarre for reading a draft of the Introduction. This book, and our Introduction in particular, has benefited greatly from their thought-provoking comments.

Lastly, our thanks go to the team at Hart/Bloomsbury Publishing for copyediting and producing this book, in particular to Emily Braggins, Rosamund Jubber and Catherine Minahan. Special thanks are due to our contributing authors. Your work has given an important insight into how a criminal conviction can affect the fundamental rights of former offenders in your countries, and will no doubt inspire future collaborations and comparative work.

Sonja Meijer, Harry Annison and Ailbhe O'Loughlin
Amsterdam, Southampton and York, January 2019



Table of Contents

Acknowledgementsv
List of Contributors..... ix

1. *Introduction*1
Sonja Meijer, Harry Annison and Ailbhe O’Loughlin

PART I
CRIMINOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVES ON LEGAL
CONSEQUENCES OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION

2. *Collateral Consequences of a Conviction in Spain*.....27
Elena Larrauri and Marti Rovira

3. *Incapacitation: Salutory Protection of Society or the Definitive
Elimination of People?*.....45
Marijke Malsch

PART II
LEGAL LIMITS ON THE LEGAL CONSEQUENCES
OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION

4. *The ‘Stain of Conviction’ – Penal Theory, Fundamental Rights
and Criminal Records in Germany*65
Christine Morgenstern

5. *Proportionality as a Constraint on the Legal Consequences
of Conviction*.....87
Sonja Meijer

6. *The Detrimental Legal Consequences of a Conviction in Hungary*107
Krisztina Lukács and Dávid Vig

7. *Challenging the Legitimacy and Limits of Criminal Background
Checks in Switzerland*.....129
Anna Coninx

8. *Relevance of a Criminal Record to Employment Opportunity:
A Greek Example for Comprehensive Law Reform*.....147
Dimitra Blitsa and Anna Kivrakidou

PART III
DANGEROUS OFFENDERS AND LEGAL CONSEQUENCES
OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION

9. *Fundamental Rights and Indeterminate Sentencing in England and Wales: The Value and Limits of a Right to Rehabilitation* 169
Harry Annison and Ailbhe O’Loughlin
10. *Intensive Supervision of Sexual and Violent Offenders in Germany*..... 189
Axel Dessecker
11. *Bifurcation and Redemption in France* 209
Martine Herzog-Evans
12. *Australia’s Expanding Jurisprudence of Risk: A Critical Analysis of Australian Preventive Detention and Post-Sentence Supervision Systems*..... 227
Patrick Keyzer and Darren O’Donovan

PART IV
JUVENILE OFFENDERS AND LEGAL CONSEQUENCES
OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION

13. *The Albatross of Juvenile Criminal Records*..... 249
Nicola Carr
14. *Dutch Criminal Record Screening in Light of International Children’s Rights Standards*..... 265
Elina van ’t Zand-Kurtovic
- Index* 285

List of Contributors

Harry Annison

Associate Professor in Criminal Law and Criminology, School of Law, University of Southampton, England, United Kingdom

Dimitra Blitsa

Public prosecutor, LL.M. LSE NYU, PhD candidate Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece

Nicola Carr

Associate Professor in Criminology, University of Nottingham, England, United Kingdom

Anna Coninx

Assistant Professor in Criminal and Criminal Procedural Law, University of Luzern, Switzerland

Axel Dessecker

Professor in Criminology and Criminal Law, Institute for Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Sciences, Georg August University, Göttingen, and Deputy Director, Centre for Criminology (KrimZ), Wiesbaden, Germany

Martine Herzog-Evans

Professor in Criminal Law and Criminology, University of Rheims, France

Patrick Keyzer

Head of School and Chair of Law and Public Policy, La Trobe University Law School, Melbourne, Australia

Anna Kivrakidou

Criminal defence lawyer, PhD Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece

Elena Larrauri

Professor in Criminal Law and Criminology, Pompeu Fabra University, Barcelona, Spain

Krisztina Lukács

Legal advisor Constitutional Court, Hungary

Marijke Malsch

Senior researcher Netherlands Institute for the Study of Crime and Law Enforcement (NSCR), Amsterdam, the Netherlands

x *List of Contributors*

Christine Morgenstern

Professor in Criminal Law and Criminology, Ernst Moritz Arndt University, Greifswald, Germany

Sonja Meijer

Assistant Professor in Criminal Law, VU University Amsterdam, the Netherlands

Darren O'Donovan

Senior Lecturer in Administrative Law, Human Rights Law and International Law, La Trobe University Law School, Melbourne, Australia

Ailbhe O'Loughlin

Lecturer in Criminal Law, York Law School, University of York, England, United Kingdom

Martí Rovira

Postdoctoral Researcher in Sociology and Criminology, Department of Sociology, University of Oxford

David Vig

Senior Lecturer in Criminology and Penology at the Department of Criminology, Eötvös Loránd University Budapest, Hungary

Elina van 't Zand-Kurtovic

Assistant Professor in Criminology, Leiden University, Leiden, the Netherlands